

University of Massachusetts Boston

ScholarWorks at UMass Boston

Women's and Gender Studies Faculty
Publication Series

Women's and Gender Studies

1994

"Education for Service": Gender, Class, & Professionalism at the Boston Normal School, 1870-1920

Ann Froines

University of Massachusetts Boston, ann.froines@umb.edu

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.umb.edu/womst_faculty_pubs



Part of the [Social and Philosophical Foundations of Education Commons](#), [Teacher Education and Professional Development Commons](#), [Women's History Commons](#), and the [Women's Studies Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Froines, Ann, "'Education for Service': Gender, Class, & Professionalism at the Boston Normal School, 1870-1920" (1994). *Women's and Gender Studies Faculty Publication Series*. 1.
https://scholarworks.umb.edu/womst_faculty_pubs/1

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Women's and Gender Studies at ScholarWorks at UMass Boston. It has been accepted for inclusion in Women's and Gender Studies Faculty Publication Series by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks at UMass Boston. For more information, please contact scholarworks@umb.edu.

"Education for Service":
Gender, Class, & Professionalism at the Boston Normal
School, 1870-1920

*by Ann Froines
UMass Boston*

"Education for Service," and "The Truth Shall Make You Free," are two aphorisms engraved in granite over doorways of the Boston Normal School (BNS) buildings on Huntington Avenue in Boston. One can argue that the history of women in the teaching profession, its paradoxical and conflicted reality, are reflected in the complex and contradictory meanings of these two aphorisms. Young women students at BNS were moving toward greater *freedom* or autonomy by taking advantage of the educational opportunity available to them in this city-supported, tuition-free teacher training institution. At the same time, they were providing a crucial social *service* sanctioned by traditional views of women, and controlled, for the most part, by male dominated institutions--city political structures, the state legislature, the business community, and, eventually, the "professional" education establishment represented by school administrators and university trained education specialists.

Goals of this Study

The purpose of this study is to explore how female BNS students and graduates--the Boston public elementary school teachers-- viewed themselves, as professional teachers, in contrast to how the rest of the world viewed them. By highlighting some of the achievements of women who worked at BNS, in the Boston public

schools, or on the Boston School Committee, in the period 1870-1920, I illustrate briefly diverse paths women followed in order to realize a career as an educator, or to influence the public schools to improve the lives of children. In order to understand the context in which they studied and worked we must also pay attention to how the nature and organization of teacher training and the teaching profession changed over the 50 year period. Finally, the responses of teachers to increased centralized control by the Boston School Department over their work environment need to be included since teachers used a variety of methods to improve their status and working conditions

Historians examining women's higher education in the last two decades of the 19th century and the first two of the 20th seem to agree on several things: that women, after much debate, grudgingly became accepted in most higher education institutions; that the professional roles for women saw considerable expansion; and that educated women, teachers in particular, linked the work of their profession with other causes, such as social reform, community improvement, and women's suffrage. They also agree that the educational advancement women made in this period slowed, however, and even declined beginning in 1920. In spite of the gains they made, women rarely found equity with men in higher education, and the fields open to them generally reinforced their secondary, "social housekeeping," or nurturing roles in society. Some have argued that "the professional roles they developed for themselves perpetuated and, in fact, institutionalized the ideology of gender difference." (Schwager, 183) Using feminine "difference" to

support arguments for expansion of women's social roles and political rights has been a consistent approach of many women's rights advocates from the mid-nineteenth century until today.

But historians writing on the history of women's higher education in America have also tended to focus on attempts of women to achieve equity with men, either by attending an elite women's college, or by seeking equal opportunities in coeducational universities. The relationship between the expansion of opportunities in higher education, the growing demand for schoolteachers, teacher training in normal schools, and the status of women in the teaching profession is a neglected chapter in this history. It hasn't been completely overlooked, however. Barbara Solomon, whose In The Company of Educated Women provides the most comprehensive study on women's higher education so far, points out that the demand for teachers helped women break down the barriers to college education.

The upsurge in secondary school enrollments led to the expansion of normal schools for teacher training. Moreover, some women combined training and teaching before continuing on to further education, for although a college degree was not required to teach, the advantage of a college education soon became apparent. (Solomon, 47)

The history of normal schools and teacher training colleges has been documented by historians of higher education, however; their conclusions will be discussed in the concluding sections of this paper.

Feminist historians perhaps have not been attracted to the study of teacher education as part of women's higher education because women were "tracked" into this field, as a maternal work

role fitting women's "nature," and as a result of intentional discrimination within the field of public education itself. Another factor contributing to the neglect of normal schools is that "higher education" is seen to be synonymous with programs offering the Baccalaureate degree, and the normal schools provided a one, two, at the most three year post secondary diploma. Still, consider that the majority of women in the 19th century who received post secondary education attended a normal school. Or that single largest area of employment for women college graduates was elementary and secondary school teaching. Or that the vast majority of educated black women were trained as teachers in normal schools and teachers colleges. Then we realize what an important piece of women's history is the normal school experience. I was surprised to learn that even in 1972, the year I began teaching Women's Studies, one third of all BA/BS degrees granted by Massachusetts public colleges and universities were in the field of education. For all of these reasons the story of normal schools should be included in the history of women's higher education.

The Beginnings of Normal Schools and the Place of Women

In the U.S. normal schools (from the French "Ecole Normal") were initiated in the first half of the 19th century by educational reformers in Massachusetts (1837), Philadelphia (1848) and other eastern states. The main purpose of the normal course of study, sometimes only several months long, was to prepare teachers for elementary schools. The innovative reform was the fact that normals were organized by the state, or city, and were tuition-free for those

who agreed to "keep school." From the beginning the main argument used to persuade officials to provide qualified teachers for the common or "free" public schools was that the progress of civilization required it. At his dedication speech for the state normal school in Bridgewater, Mass. in 1846, Horace Mann, the first president of the Mass. Board of Education asserted:

I believe Normal Schools to be a new instrumentality in the advancement of the race. I believe, that without them, Free Schools themselves would be shorn of their strength and their healing power, and would at length become charity schools, and thus die out in fact and in form. (Mann, handout, 1385)

He goes on to conclude that without the free schools a corrupt oligarchy will rule over the land.

In Massachusetts very quickly the teaching profession became predominantly women. It was the only profession open to women, moreover, women could be paid half of what men needed, lamented Henry Barnard. And most conveniently, the work of teaching corresponded with the prevailing beliefs in the nation about womanhood: "*The education of children*, that is the true and noble profession of a woman--*that* is worthy of the noblest powers and affections of the noblest minds." (Beecher, handout, 1318) In the words of these prominent leaders in education, three notions are linked which would shape debates about public schooling for the rest of the century: the need to have an educated citizenry in order to reach the self-governing ideals of American democracy; the natural suitability of women for the teaching profession; and especially important for practical minded legislators, the lower wages required by women teachers as compared to men. There was little talk of

schoolgirls thirst for higher education or women's rights to its benefits. But the record shows that for these reasons, too, women entered normal schools in the 19th century.

After the Civil War, normal schools developed throughout the United States, most of them to provide teachers to the rural population but others to guarantee an ample supply of trained teachers for the graded city schools. The newly freed African-American population in the South required teachers desperately for the largely separate "colored" schools. The Hampton Institute and Fisk University are well known for providing, respectively, industrial education and college education to generations of African Americans. Less celebrated is the fact that both produced many hundreds of men and women teachers for the segregated schools in the South. Northern supporters of higher education for African Americans commented on the freedmen's (and women's) "thirst for knowledge," as well as the excellent training they received at Hampton and like institutions. In 1874 two Hampton Institute teachers published a little book, Hampton Institute and its Students, that contained testimonials from Virginia school superintendents on the highly satisfactory performance of Hampton graduates. Again the theme of democracy is raised:

The colored teachers from your school have been well instructed in the rudimentary branches taught in our public schools; in fact, better than many of the white teachers employed in our schools. . .The Negro race must be educated in the Common English branches if they are to make citizens in the government. Our free institutions demand it. (Armstrong, 164)

It was even more imperative for African American women to attend school, then strive to receive some advanced education, since the majority of them would have to work. Their occupations were generally limited to domestic service and teaching in "colored" schools. For African American women entry into the teaching profession was the one sure way to surmount the severe limitations and stereotyping society placed on them. Historians of African American women have chronicled the lives of those remarkable leaders who founded schools for the black community, such as Nannie Helen Burroughs, Charlotte Hawkins Brown, and Mary McLeod Bethune. (Giddings, 101) Less well documented are the lives of the majority, the thousands of normal school educated women like Mamie Garvin Fields, who taught in rural county schools throughout the south. Since career teachers generally didn't create institutions, write books, or move in political circles, unless they wrote memoirs or told their stories, we know little about their education and their work. But through oral history, the remarkable career of Fields is known to us, and there were perhaps many more like her. Fields pressured reluctant School Departments for more resources, organized parents into school booster groups, and created new school programs for 17 years in Society Corner, South Carolina, in order to advance self-esteem in school children in that community and thereby "uplift" the race. (Fields, with Fields)

Normal schools, were also known as "peoples' colleges," during this period, places where children of farmers, artisans, and even middle class professionals or businessmen, could receive higher education at low cost. This was especially true in the midwestern

and western states. Students were predominantly women, and it is likely that the majority of them taught for at least some years. A few went on to other careers, however, by using the normal school preparation as a stepping stone to other higher education programs, even including graduate study or medical school. The male graduates of Massachusetts' Westfield Normal School were accused of using this free public education for "private advancement." (Herbst, 77) Especially in Massachusetts, dominated by elite private colleges and universities, where there was no public university until after World War II, normal schools, and later teachers colleges, were the only route to higher education for those of more limited means.

By 1870, however, the Normal School establishment was already supporting the idea of college level instruction -- "a scientifically based professional education"--for the curricula of some normal schools, for example Westfield. (Herbst, 91) These advances, argues normal school historian Jurgen Herbst, were bought at the expense of improving the training for the elementary school teacher, and solidifying the foundation for a professional or vocational approach to teacher training. Instead of teacher training, the state normal schools would concentrate on preparing high school teachers, administrators, and educators of teachers. "State normal schools would become the scientific centers for the study of pedagogy and school administration on every level. They would be the future of the profession." (Herbst, 108) The principles of scientific management being tried out in the business community would everywhere influence the organization and governance of school systems by the end of the century.

The history of the city normal schools was somewhat different, however, since the demand for elementary school teachers grew rapidly in 1870 as a result of industrialization and immigration. Parallel trends developed later in the city normal schools, as the history of BNS will demonstrate. A closer examination of teacher education at BNS with the limited evidence available will reveal the power and resiliency of some women's ideas and actions in the struggle to establish teaching as a profession, not just a woman's responsibility or true calling.

Boston Normal Schools, 1870-1900

In 1872 BNS separated from Girls' High to become an autonomous institution for teacher preparation. I was unable to find much information in either archival or secondary sources about teachers' professional training in the earlier years of BNS. Boston women began to take an interest in the public schools in the 1870's. Both women and men interested in moral reform acknowledged that the schools could be a site for reforms, citing the Wordsworth adage, "the child is the father of the man." Numerous Protestant Boston women, some with family wealth and prestige behind them, turned their attention to two women's issues --the health of women and the moral education of young children. These women had begun their social activism with the Civil War work of organizations like the Sanitary Commission and the Freedmen's Society.

The New England Women's Club, founded in 1868 as a venue for discussion of these issues, took up discussion of the election of women to the Boston School Committee, as a strategy for influencing

the schools, and as a wedge into electoral politics prior to the granting of full suffrage. Inspired by the example of England where women were elected to School Boards, the Women's Club, and soon The Women's Journal, the publication of the American Women's Suffrage Association in Boston, strongly endorsed the necessity of women's influence on the public schools:

Women were concerned with health and physical education, correction of overcrowding, adequate ventilation and heating, and the personal cleanliness of children. Women knew 'the importance of a right direction to education from its earliest beginning.'" (Kaufman, 36)

By 1875, after legal maneuvering and much campaigning, women gained six seats on the 90 member Boston School Committee. Very soon these women clashed with the Superintendent of Schools over the issue of admission of girls to Boston Latin School, the only public high school which prepared students to enter colleges. Some of these women school committee members were activists in the struggle for women's rights, and were college educated themselves, so they tried to use their new found political status to open up another education option for girls besides the normal school course of study. Although they failed to achieve their goal, a separate college preparatory high school for girls was established in Boston--Girls' Latin.

It is not easy to identify solid connections between the ideas of these women reformers and those of the students and teachers of BNS. Surely the reformers believed they were, and in fact, were, working on behalf of the women teachers in Boston. They tried with some success to improve the physical surroundings in the classroom, to get higher wages for teachers, to support progressive ideas about

classroom discipline. They also pressed for the appointment of women to school principal positions. Often they linked their support for women's leadership roles in the schools with the argument that it was an economic necessity, rather than a question of equity, for unmarried or widowed women, to earn an adequate salary.

One such unmarried and self-supporting woman was Katharine Shute, a teacher of English at BNS from 1885 to 1932, when she retired as head of the department. She herself graduated from BNS in 1882, thus her career at BNS nearly spans the period of this study. Shute lived in Roxbury with her sister, Mary Shute, head of the kindergarten department at BNS, and two cousins who were both teachers at Girls' High. (Flynn, 51) The few details available about her life as a teacher suggest that she had a strong identification as a professional teacher and considered herself someone with an intellectual, as well as service, contribution to make.

From a brief essay she writes on her life as a student and teacher, we gain a sense of her love of teaching and her considerable intellectual achievement, independently obtained. Of course, as a teacher of teachers, she was training young adults, not teaching elementary school. When she reflects on her memories of her own unpleasantly competitive grammar school experience, she offers a lesson in pedagogical advances of the period. Children were seated each week according to their grades of the previous week, she writes, and might feel a proud moment upon taking possession of desk number one. Apparently, her own teaching experience made her re-evaluate that system:

And now, as you look back, you see the pity of it all:

the ambition for marks, the rivalries, the petty jealousies, even the temptation to achieve credits in some questionable way. Incidentally, what happened to the children who always sat in the last rows and expected always to sit there?" (Boston Teachers' News-letter,10)

Clearly, many rethinkings and revisions of pedagogical techniques are reflected in that last question.

Shute remembers from her own childhood, however, some inspired teachers who helped her acquire historical background and literary taste and judgement from reading distinguished authors. She comments on the thrill of discovery which must accompany all learning. She enters BNS as a student, even though it was reputed to be a difficult place, "all hard work, no leisure, in school or out." (Ibid,14) She relives her discovery of her love of teaching, and the intensity of the four weeks of practice teaching in the local elementary school. "The connection, you see, was very close between our educational theory and our actual work with children." (Ibid, 15) Describing her first classroom teaching experience in the second grade, Shute continues:

How much those tiny, irrepressible boys and girls taught me! How individual they were, how much they already knew, how much they felt no interest in knowing, and how much they could learn when they were interested! (Ibid, 15)

These brief statements reveal the potential of normal school training to develop the *professional classroom teacher*, a potential that is "betrayed" by the end of the century in normal schools, according to Jurgin Herbst.

There are other aspects of Shute's recollections which illustrate her professional commitment and associations. She describes how a teacher's education must continue constantly, especially when the preparatory course is brief. She remembers how she read and discussed classics of English literature with other teachers, attended lectures sponsored by the Lowell Institute, and studied for two years with a Harvard professor. These activities no doubt were carried out well into the twentieth century, throughout her career. She mentions modestly her "membership in organizations which are working for some significant end," as one source of her education. (Ibid, 16) In fact, Shute was active in the Boston Teachers' Club, a group affiliated with the Mass. Federation of Teachers, was a supporter of women's suffrage, and was the first woman to become president of the New England Association for Teachers. (Flynn, 51) Finally, she modelled her professional commitments to students at BNS by serving as the advisor to the BNS publication, "The Torch," in the 1920's. "The Torch" was a good quality journal published three or four times in year containing student essays on various themes and reports of professional activities of BNS staff.

Teaching may have been designated as women's "true" (read "natural") profession in the middle of the 19th century. By the end of the century, however, with a model teacher like Katharine Shute, multiplied a thousand times over in normal schools around the country, new teachers entered the profession with a solid perception of the actual activities of the professional teacher--constant attention to professional development, participation in professional associations, and adherence to a set of values, chief of which was to

respect the potential of children to learn. Of course not all teachers would measure up to these ideals--in what profession is that true?--but the point here is to define the benchmarks of professionalism in the teachers' training and unfolding consciousness.

Not only normal school trained teachers sought teaching jobs and aspired to be professionals in the field. Teaching was the most attractive career for native born white women, the second most important occupation, the first being factory work. Among native born women college graduates, teaching was even more important. "Thirty eight percent of Smith College graduates from the classes of 1879 to 1888 became primary and secondary school teachers, while only 11 percent became doctors, professors, college deans, and architects combined." (Carter, in Warren, 56) Since teaching was designated the "female" profession--and therefore wide open to women--they entered it, even if not "born" or highly dedicated, like Katharine Shute, and even though teachers were poorly paid relative to the training and hard work their positions required. Again, we see the complex, contradictory, even paradoxical linking of "teaching" with the female gender. (Some teachers quit their jobs to enter local factory work if the factory pay was better; labor markets certainly played a major role in the development of the teaching profession, some would say *the* major role. --A nod to Paul H.)

Collegiate women from more upper middle class backgrounds, as social reformers, began to take an interest in public schooling. The Association of Collegiate Alumni (ACA), the precursor of the American Association of University Women, focused in the 1880's and 1890's on the stereotypes and debates about college educated

women. In 1885, for example, ACA published a report on "The Health Status of College Graduates," as a response to the bestselling book Sex in Education (1873), by Dr. Edward H. Clarke of Harvard University. The report demonstrated that women's health was unaffected by the demands of intellectual work, in opposition to the dire claims of the good doctor. Originally founded to advance the interests of college educated women, by 1900 the ACA had joined other national women's organizations to cooperate on issues involving the welfare of public school children. (Frankfort, 94) Like the earlier Boston social reformers, and often in alliance with teachers' groups, educated women, some themselves at one time teachers, directed their attention to the gender-appropriate issue of school children's welfare, rather than confront the professional issues facing women in the male-dominated fields.

Near the turn of the century, teachers concerns focused on the low and inequitable salaries, and lack of job security or retirement pensions. Boston School Committee members William Gallivan and Fanny Ames, joined forces in 1896 to petition for a raise in Boston teachers' salaries. The average monthly salary for women teachers was \$48, for men, \$128. (Kaufman, 296) Even though women "assistants" were doing substantially the same work as the men "junior-masters" in the high schools, the hierarchical and gender-linked system of classification was used to justify the men's higher salaries. College educations, years of experience were often ignored when women were hired into the "assistant" category. When the School Committee voted to raise salaries of women teachers, men received raises, too, preserving the differential.

Boston City school politics becomes a very complex story at the turn of the century, and is not really the focus of this paper. But Polly Kaufman's study of school politics does expose some of the hidden history of the BNS. Several school committee members, led by Julia Duff, representing the new found influence of Irish immigrants in city politics, were determined to create better opportunities for young Irish women to become teachers in Boston. BNS graduates were on a long waiting list for positions in the city because there was an "oversupply" of BNS graduates in 1899. According to Kaufman, Duff's indignation "exposed the roots of the ethnic controversy that were hidden beneath the drive for professionalism by the Yankee Protestant leaders." (Kaufman, 339) A struggle to preserve neighborhood control of the schools (some labelled it "patronage") finally ended when "good government" forces managed to get the schools under the control of administrators trained in modern management methods. (Ibid, 380) Simultaneously, the Boston School Committee, reduced earlier from 90-plus members to 24, was reduced to five in 1905.

School administration reform, ethnic politics, and loss of women's influence in school committee affairs at the turn of the century is documented both in Kaufman's work and in histories of teacher activism. (Fraser, Urban in Warren) In the first decades of the 20th century, the ideas of "professionalization" complete the transformation of teacher education, school systems become more centralized, women teachers organize, and the BNS expands its facilities and programs.

Boston Normal School, 1900-1922

BNS moved to a specially built facility on Huntington Avenue in 1907, the same year a special one year course is launched to prepare *men* college graduates to be high school teachers. In 1913 the course of study at BNS for elementary school teachers is extended to three years. It is worth noting that eight different subject courses at BNS were inspected by the Harvard Board for University Extension and approved as "collegiate level" courses. BNS students, as a result, could apply them for full credit toward an A.A. degree at Harvard extension. (Flynn, 54) This can be considered evidence that the academic level of subject courses at BNS was at least equivalent to collegiate courses. As part of a national trend, in 1922 a four year course of study is established: now BNS offered a B.S. degree in Education, in addition to the diploma. A new Master of Education program begins for curriculum specialists and administrators. All this lays the groundwork to rename BNS in 1924 the Teachers' College of the City of Boston.

These changes mark the ascendancy of other professionals in education over classroom teachers. Elementary school teaching is now almost completely a women's profession. As we direct our eyes upward from the bottom of the career ladder in school systems, we begin to see the men: teaching in high schools, as headmasters and principals and superintendents, as teacher educators and curriculum specialists. *Elementary* school teacher trainers at BNS, however, were almost all women, except for the "department" masters and the headmaster. (*The ALPHA*, 1917)

Data gathered by the National Education Association in a "1905 study of 467 systems showed that the average salary for a woman elementary school teacher was \$650 per year, while men in the same position--where there were any--were paid \$1,161. (Fraser, in Warren, 122) Urban elementary school teachers found themselves at the bottom of the hierarchy. "The power teachers exercised over the children 'beneath' her was more than matched by the power of professional school administrators over the teacher herself. In relation to the men above them, teachers might as well have been children." (Hoffman, 202)

Boston teachers weren't children, nor, even at the bottom of the pay scale and career ladder, were they completely powerless. Teachers were not silent about the contradictions they faced in their profession. One of these was the contradiction between the supposed role of the schools in teaching democratic values, and the lack of a voice by teachers in the decisions even concerning their own classrooms. Margaret Haley, the forceful and dynamic leader of the Chicago Teachers' Federation made this point in many speeches. To have a democratic classroom would mean a whole program of changes for school teachers, as follows: increase teacher salaries, provide some tenure and pensions, reduce the heavy workload in overcrowded classrooms, and reverse the "factoryizing" of education through recognition of teachers' skills as educators. (Fraser, in Warren, 130)

In fact, during this period, women teachers made some progress in all of these areas, by organizing and pressuring school systems and political leaders for changes. In Chicago for a time,

Teachers' Councils had a great deal to say about curriculum. In Boston, teachers sought support from women's suffrage associations and labor leaders, alliances which helped them win a salary increase in 1919. Unfortunately, sometimes teachers' victories turned into defeats. With their organizations behind them, however, the leaders of teachers had to be dealt with, "if not as equals, at least as professionals " (Ibid, 149)

Occasionally a school superintendent might be sympathetic to teachers' concerns, and work on their behalf. Frank V. Thompson, Superintendent in Boston for only three years before his death in 1921, was well regarded by teachers. In a eulogy published in "The Torch," Wallace C. Boyden, BNS principal from 1900-1928, defined the quality of "service" which Thompson had demonstrated:

He gave himself unsparingly to the service of children in the schools under his charge. . .In all his living, with its manifold and perplexing details he was always a human being dealing with human beings for the benefit of human life.." ("The Torch," Nov 1921, 2)

I cite this eulogy to show that this ideology of service to children was not completely restricted to the female gender. Some men, even those in high administrative positions, also identified with the concept "education for service," engraved in the doorway at BNS. By 1920 the definition of "service" in the teaching profession had undergone a subtle shift, perhaps as part of the "professionalization" within the field that Herbst and others deplore. Service to children in schools is no longer simply a moral calling for nurturing women, but a *public service*, controlled and mediated by an increasingly

centralized bureaucracy, and organized hierarchically according to gender.

Herbst argues that unionization is the elementary school teachers' reponse to the neglect they've suffered at the hands of administrators. "For these women, teacher unionization has not been a rebellion against the idea of professionalism in teaching, but a demand that they be awarded the same professional recognition and opportunities that their instructors and superintendents have withheld from them." (Herbst, 192)

Classroom teachers' reduction of autonomy is not only gender-related; they are also seen as "public servants," as well as women, and therefore are subject to political shifts in the public perception of the field of teaching. No other profession is so identified with public service; no other profession is so dependent on the depth of the taxpayer's pocket. Unlike other professionals--lawyers, doctors (at least until recently)--teachers cannot solely through their associations determine the rates they will charge for their professional expertise.. Teachers have to fight for salary increases from school systems, or city and state governments, and therefore turned to unionization to challenge the power of these institutions.

Conclusions

Women organized teachers unions for job security, for equity as women, and to regain control over the application of their professional skills in the classroom. I agree with Herbst that the teacher unionization movement should not be interpreted as a "choice" to move away from defining teaching as a profession and toward a labor-management employment model. The teachers'

choices were severely limited by the organization of the "service" they deliver and by the historically low status of accorded care-giving work in U.S. society.

Another way of interpreting Herbst's conclusion about the "treason" of the normal school educators in turning away from the education of the classroom teacher, would be to say that men, in trying to make the education "profession" equivalent in pay, power, and prestige to the other "male professions," built it up into the hierarchical field it is today. Toward this goal they had the help of other men in locations of power, the business community, the politicians, and the major universities.

On the other hand, it would appear that the instructors at BNS continued even in the 20th century to instill professional values in their students, which is a way of according them " professional recognition." "Loyalty to the school children of Boston," was part of the faithfulness to the teaching profession, articulated by young Marguerite Sullivan in her Class Day message to BNS graduates in 1917. Young Irish Catholic women at this time are a substantial minority in the BNS population, but they are carrying on in the traditions established by their Protestant "foremothers" and teachers. How does Sullivan illustrate this value of loyalty? "A boy works ten times harder when he knows that you trust him." (*The ALPHA*, 79) A good teacher refuses to listen to the "reputations" of her pupils, Sullivan continues, and in this way, creates a "transformation" in her pupils. Behind these ideas I suggest is the voice of Katharine Shute in the classroom, and the cumulative experience of the best classrooms of Boston where BNS students got their practice teaching.

This essential value, loyalty to the child and his or her potential, a cornerstone of the teaching profession, is one Herbst and others see taking second place to other values. But in some places, at least, it is still part of the teacher training culture.

Incidentally, Marguerite G. Sullivan, vice president of the BNS class of 1917, became the first woman assistant superintendent of the Boston Public Schools in the Department of Practice and Training. (Flynn, 49) (I am assuming there was only one Marguerite G. Sullivan with such leadership ability at BNS during the period 1917 to 1950, but I can't be absolutely certain.) Apparently she worked her way up to this position either through the school system, or by first being a teacher trainer herself, perhaps on the faculty of the BNS. Her career may illustrate Herbst's thesis that expert teachers were pulled out of the classroom into administration. But at the same time, her career represents the living transmission between generations of teachers of the important pedagogical knowledge and experience latent in the normal school tradition.

I have tried to discuss "professionalism" in teaching without imposing contemporary sociological definitions or popular understandings about "professions" on my categories. Instead, I hope the meaning emerges from the words and ideas of the BNS students and Boston teachers themselves, as well as from the secondary sources. One definition that seems to fit BNS especially well is the following: Graduates of professional schools adhere "to certain norms of conduct and belief" and are "guided by specialized knowledge in their decisions." (Goodlad, 32) Until 1920 at any rate, which is the scope of this paper, the graduates of BNS fit this

definition of a "professional school" graduate. Based on the limited materials available, I also conclude that they viewed themselves as "worthy members of a great profession," comparable to other professions, even doctors and lawyers. (*The ALPHA*, 78)

To return to the aphorisms over the doorways of the BNS building. . . Knowledge of the "truth" ("The Truth Shall Make You Free"), in this case higher education, is certainly not sufficient, in the example of the teachers, for freedom and autonomy, either as individuals or as a professional group. But it certainly is a prerequisite for women's full participation in social affairs, and for greater control over her own personhood, and, through collective struggle, her profession. Women who aspire to professional status today, like one sector of the first generation of college-educated women, look first at the "knowledge" professions--college teaching, law, medicine, scientific research--and second to the "service" professions--nursing, teaching, and social work. ("Education for Service") Today, as in the 19th century, these career decisions are also based on a woman's social class and economic resources. But they also are shaped by a status system which relegates the "care-giving" professions to secondary status. (Some sociologists and economists have branded them with the dismissive label "semiprofessions.") Sara Freedman, a classroom teacher in the public schools for many years, writing about the continuing problems in the teaching profession today, in the face of another wave of neglect by "reformers," says it well:

As long as direct care of dependents is denigrated in our society as a whole, as long as the work of the heart--emotion and empathy--and the work of the head--

rationality and intellect--are seen as two separate functions, then what we now consider teaching, that is working with children (*emphasis added*) as a central part of a teacher's job, will never be given status in our society. (Freedman, in Antler, 256)

1852	City establishes Girls' H.S. and Normal School
(1875	First women elected to Boston School Committee)
(1879	Women begin to vote in school committee elections.)
(1877	A Girls' Latin school with a classical course is organized after petition to make Boys' Latin coeducational fails.)
1888	Course to prepare elementary school teachers at BNS extended to one and one-half year.
1892	Teacher training program extended to two years after high school. Two year kindergarten program established.
1907	BNS moves to specially built facility on Huntington Avenue. Building, formerly part of Boston State College stands today, with name engraved in stone. Men college graduates admitted to one year course to prepare as high school teachers.
1913	Course of study extended to three years.
1922	New four year degree course of study established. M. Ed. program begins.
1924	BNS renamed Teachers' College of the City of Boston.
Note:	From 1872-1922, BNS graduated 4,172 pupils; as of May, 1923, there were 1,820 BNS graduates working in the Boston Schools. At least 14 graduates taught at the BNS.

Sources: Flynn, Elizabeth, History of BNS - Teachers College, 1980. UMass Archives.
(Kaufman, Polly, Boston Women and City School Politics, 1872-1905, University Microfilms, 1978.)

Works Cited

- The Alpha, Boston Normal School Yearbook, 1917, UMass Boston Archives.
- Antler, Joyce and Biklen, Sari K, (eds), *Changing Education: Women as Radicals and Conservators*, Albany, SUNY Press, 1990.
- Sara Freedman, "Weeding Women out of 'Woman's True Profession'"
- Armstrong, Mrs. M. F. and Ludlow, Helen, *Hampton and its Students, by Two of its Teachers*, 1874. NY AMS Press, Inc. Reprinted 1971.
- Fields, Mamie Garvin, with Karen Fields, *Lemon Swamp and other Places, A Carolina Memoir*, New York: The Free Press, 1983.
- Frankfort, Roberta, *Collegiate Women - Domesticity and Career in Turn of the Century America*, New York: New York University Press, 1977.
- Goodlad, John I. et al, (eds), *Places Where Teachers Are Taught*, San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publ., 1990.
- Herbst, Jurgin, *And Sadly Teach - Teacher Education and Professionalization in American Culture*, Madison: Univ of Wisconsin Press, 1989.
- Hoffman, Nancy, *Woman's "True" Profession: Voices from the History of Teaching*, Old Westbury, NY: Feminist Press, 1981.
- Kaufman, Polly, *Boston Women and City School Politics, 1872-1905*, University Microfilms, 1978. (EdD Dissertation)
- Schwager, Sally, "Educating Women in America," in E. Minnich et al (eds.) *Reconstructing the Academy: Women's Education and Women's Studies*, Chicago, Univ of Chicago Press, 1988.
- Shute, Katharine, "Reflections from our Members" Boston Women's Teachers' Newsletter, March, 1931, UMass Boston Archives.
- Warren, Donald (ed.) *American Teachers, History of a Profession at Work*, New York, Macmillan, 1989.
- Susan Carter, " Incentives and Rewards to Teaching"
- James W. Fraser, "Agents of Democracy: Urban Elementary School Teachers and the Conditions of Teaching"
- Wayne J. Urban, "Teacher Activism"